BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10631530 2

Cases on Evidence

(1988-89 Edition)

Volume 1

Selected by Alan W. Mewett

These materials are intended for use in the Evidence Course of Professor Mewett in the Faculty of Law of the University of Toronto

LAW LIBRARY

SEP 2 2 1988

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Cases on Evidence

(1988-89 Edition)

Volume 1

Selected by Alan W. Mewett

These materials are intended for use in the Evidence Course of Professor Mewett in the Faculty of Law of the University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/casesonevidence01mewe_3

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Statutes	Page
Charter of Rights	1
Canada Evidence Act	2
Evidence Act of Ontario	10
1. Introduction	
Batary v. A.G. Sask., [1965] S.C.R. 465	24
Bruno (1976), 27 C.C.C.(2d) 318	28
Pappajohn (1980), 14 C.R.(3d) 243	29
Oakes (1983), 2 C.C.C.(3d) 339	33
Morris (1984), 36 C.R.(3d) 1	41
2. Competence, Compellability and Oaths	
Gosselin (1907), 7 C.C.C. 139	50
McConnell and Beer, [1968] S.C.R. 802	53
Vezeau, [1977] 2 S.C.R. 277	57
Hoskyn v. M.P.C., [1978] 2 W.L.R. 695	58
Bowles (1967), 50 C.R. 353	59
Sillars (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 202	61
Czipps (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 193	63
McNamara (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 210	67
Fellichle (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 207	70
Agawa (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 293	72
McLaughlin (1974), 24 C.R.N.S. 362	73
Walsh (1979), 45 C.C.C.(2d) 199	77
Gunewardene, [1951] 2 K.B. 600	81
Toohey v. M.P.C., [1965] A.C. 595	83
Hawke (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 1	87
Sankey (1927), 48 C.C.C. 97	92
Budin (1981), 58 C.C.C.(2d) 352 (Ont.C.A.)	94
Kendall, [1962] S.C.R. 469	96
3. Refreshing Memory	
McInroy and Rouse (1977), 5 C.R.(3d) 125	98
Davey (1969), 6 C.R.N.S. 288	101
Bengert (1980), 15 C.R.(3d) 21; 15 C.R.(3d) 114 at 160	104
4. Credibility	
(a) Expert Evidence	
Wilband, [1967] 2 C.C.C. 6	106
Rosik (1971), 13 C.R.N.S. 129	108
Abbey (1982), 43 N.R. 30	116
Phillion (1977), 37 C.R.N.S. 361	122
Béland (1988), 60 C.R. (3d) 1 (S.C.C.)	126
(b) Enhancing Credibility	
Clark (1984), 40 C.R.(3d) 183	142
Kyselka, [1962] O.W.N. 164	148
Corke v. Corke, [1958] 1 All E.R. 224	149
Welstead v. Brown, [1952] 1 S.C.R. 3	151
Pappin (1970), 12 C.R.N.S. 287 (Ont.C.A.).	153
Rozich (1980), 10 C.R.(3d) 364	154
Giraldi (1975), 28 C.C.C.(2d) 248	157
Panglinan (1988), 60 C.R. (3d) 188.	160
(c) Complaints in Sexual Cases	
Sexual Offences Act	162
Timm (1981), 59 C.C.C.(2d) 396 (S.C.C.)	162
Page (1984), 40 C.R.(3d) 85	165
(d) Prior Inconsistent Statements	
Deacon (1947), S.C.R. 531	170
McInroy and Rouse, [1979] 1 S.C.R. 588	171
Wawanesa v. Hanes, [1961] O.R. 495	176
Milgaard (1971), 14 C.R.N.S. 34	179
Cronshaw (1977), 3 C.C.C.(2d) 183 (Prov.Ct.)	183

Credibility (contd)	Page
(e) Prior Convictions	
Criminal Code s.593	184
D'Aoust (1902), 5 C.C.C. 407	184
Koufis (1941), S.C.R. 481	185
Titchner, [1961] O.R. 606	186
St. Pierre (1974), 17.C.C.C.(2d) 489	188
Morris (1979), 43 C.C.C.(2d) 129	190
(f) Prior Sexual Conduct	
Criminal Code ss. 246.6, 246.7	201
Laliberte, [1877] 1 S.C.R. 117	202
Forsythe (1980), 15 C.R.(3d) 219	204
(g) Accused Attacking own Credibility	
French (1978), 37 C.C.C.(2d) 201	209
Helpard (1979), 10 C.R.(3d) 76	214
Dietrich (1970), 11 C.R.N.S. 129	216
R. v. K. (1979), 47 C.C.C.(2d) 436	221
5. Character	
McNamara (1981) 56 C.C.C.(2d) 193	226
Guay (1978), 42 C.C.C.(2d) 536	233
Taylor (1982), 35 O.R.(2d) 738 (Ont.C.A.)	235
Glynn (1971), 15 C.R.N.S. 343	237
Lupien (1970), 9 C.R. 165	238
Lowery, [1973] 3 W.L.R. 235	243
McMillan (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 191	248
Robertson (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 141	253
6. Similar Fact Evidence	
Criminal Code Section 312, 314(1)(b), 317, 318	255
Makin, [1894] A.C. 57	256
Smith (1916), 11 Cr. Ap. Rep. 229	259
Sweitzer (1982), 68 C.C.C.(2d) 193	260
Boardman, [1975] A.C. 421	264
Leblanc (1975), 29 C.C.C.(2d) 97	268
Cloutier (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 10	272
Straffen, [1952] 2 Q.B. 911	278
Scopelliti (1982), 63 C.C.C.(2d) 481	282
MacDonald v. Canada Kelp (1974), 39 D.L.R.(3d) 617	289
Hoffman article, (1975), 91 L.Q.R. 193	294
7. Hearsay	
(i) General	
Myers v. D.P.P., [1965] A.C. 1001	303
Ares v. Venner, [1970] S.C.R. 608	308
Subramaniam, [1956] 1 W.L.R. 965	310
Wright v. Tatham (1837), 112 E.R. 488	312
Wysochan (1930), 54 C.C.C. 172	315
Wildman (1984), 14 C.C.C.(3d) 321	317
Ratten, [1972] A.C. 378	327
(ii) Res Gestae	
Bedingfield (1879), 14 Cox C.C. 341	331
Gilbert (1907), 38 S.C.R. 284	333
Leland, [1951] O.R. 12	335
Hodd (1970), 1 C.C.C.(3d) 363	340
Graham (1972), 7 C.C.C.(2d) 93	344
Newton (1976), 34 C.R.N.S. 161	349
Risby (1977), 32 C.C.C.(2d) 242	351
Keeler (1978), 36 C.C.C.(2d) 8	352
Clark (1983), 35 C.R.(3d) 357	355
(iii) Statements Against Interest	
Donnelly v. U.S. (1913), 228 U.S. 243	371

Hearsay (contd) — Page

Agawa (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 293 — 373
Demeter (1977), 35 C.C.C.(2d) 137 — 376
O'Brien (1977), 35 C.C.C.(2d) 209 — 378
Pelletier (1978), 38 C.C.C.(2d) 515 — 381
Lucier (1982), 65 C.C.C.(2d) 150 — 383

(iv) Prior Proceedings

Criminal Code S.S. 643, 541 — 385
Walkerton v. Erdman (1894), 23 S.C.R. 352 — 386
Hollington v. Hewthorn (1943), 1 K.B. 587 — 389
Goody v. Odhams Press, [1967] 1 Q.B. 333 — 393
Gushue (1980), 50 C.C.C.(2d) 417 — 393
Grdic v. R. — 398
English v. Richmond, [1956] S.C.R. 383 — 406
Re Charlton, [1969] C.C.C.(2d) 1 — 409
Humphrys, [1976] 2 All E.R. 497 — 411
R. v. Prince — 413
Kienapple (1974), 15 C.C.C.(2d) 524 — 421

(v) Bodily and Mental Condition

Youlden (1912), 260 L.R. 75 — 423
Mutual Life v. Hillmon (1892), 145 U.S. 285 — 425
Wainwright (1875), 13 Cox C.C. 171 — 427
Thomson, [1912] 3 K.B. 19 — 428
Home v. Corbeil, [1955] 4 D.L.R. 750 — 429

(vi) Business Records

Vanlerberghe (1979), 6 C.R.(3d) 222 — 440
McMullen (1979), 47 C.C.C.(2d) 499 — 441
Civil Evidence Act (U.K.); Computer Evidence (S.Africa) — 447
Wood (1983), 76 Cr.App.R. 23 — 448

8. Confessions and Pre-Trial Statements

(i) General

Piché (1971), S.C.R. 23 — 451

(ii) Persons in Authority

Towler (1968), 5 C.R.N.S. 55 — 454
Pettipiece (1972), 18 C.R.N.S. 236 — 455
Rothman (1981), 1 S.C.R. 640 — 459
Collins (1976), 29 C.C.C.(2d) 304 — 462
Perras (1973), 11 C.C.C.(2d) 245 — 464
Stewart (1980), 54 C.C.C.(2d) 93 — 466

(iii) The Voir Dire

Thiffault (1933), 60 C.C.C. 97 — 469
Kacherowski (1978), 37 C.C.C.(2d) 257 — 471
Conkie (1978), 38 C.C.C.(2d) 408 — 473
Wert (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 254 — 475

(iv) Need for Voir Dire

Sweezey (1974), 27 C.R.N.S. 163 — 476
Powell (1976), 33 C.R.N.S. 323 — 478
Erven (1979), 6 C.R.(3d) 97 — 480
Morris (1979), 10 C.R.(3d) 59 — 491
Boulet (1977), 34 C.C.C.(2d) 345 — 494
Watson (1980), 1 W.L.R. 991 — 496
Price (1981) 59 C.C.C.(2d) 367 (Ont.Co.Ct.) — 499
Park (1981), 59 C.C.C.(2d) 385 (S.C.C.) — 501

(v) Timing of the Voir Dire

Bruno (1976), 27 C.C.C.(2d) 318 — 505

Confessions etc. (contd).

(vi) Voluntariness

Ibrahim, [1914] A.C. 599 506
Horvath (1979), 44 C.C.C.(2d) 385 509
Prager (1972), 1 All E.R. 1114 517
Serack (1973), 24 C.R.N.S. 295 519
Washer (1948), 92 C.C.C. 218 520
Ward (1979), 7 C.R.(3d) 153 521
Rothman (1981), 35 N.R. 485 524
Marshall (1960), 127 C.C.C. 76 537

(vii) Charter Cases

Clarkson (1988) 50 C.R. (3d) 289 539
Manninen (1987) 34 C.C.C. (3d) 385 546

(viii) Truth of Confession

Hammond, [1941] 3 All E.R. 318 552
Hnedish (1958), 26 W.W.R. 685 554
De Clerq, [1968] S.C.R. 902 556
Wong Kam-Ming, [1979] 2 W.L.R. 81 560

(ix) Confessions Confirmed by Subsequent Facts

St. Lawrence (1949), 93 C.C.C. 376 565
Wray (1970), 11 C.R.N.S. 235 568

(x) Use of Confessions

Jackson (1980), 57 C.C.C.(2d) 154 575
Herodotu (1979), 6 C.R.(3d) 336 580
Ma, Ho and Lai (1979), 6 C.R.(3d) 325. 584

(xi) Use of Voir Dire evidence at Trial

Van Dongen (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 346 589
Gauthier (1976), 33 C.R.N.S. 46 591
Magdish (1978) 41 C.C.C.(2d) 392 594
Brophy (1981), 2 All E.R. 705 595
Tarrant (1982), 63 C.C.C.(2d) 385 598

(xii) Adopted Statements and Silence

Chapdelaine (1935), 63 C.C.C.5 600
Fargnoli, [1957] O.R. 140 601
Govedarov (1974), 16 C.C.C.(2d) 238 602
Eden, [1970] 3 C.C.C.280 603
Sweeney (1977), 35 C.C.C.(2d) 245 605
Christie, [1914] A.C. 545 608
Sayegh (No.3) (1982), 69 C.C.C.(2d) 84 610
Parkes (1977), 64 Cr.App.R. 25 612
Gottschall (1983), 10 C.C.C.(2d) 447 613

(xiii) Consciousness of Guilt and Lies

Burdick (1975) 27 C.C.C. (2d) 497 626
Sparrow (1979), 12 C.R. (3d) 158 629

(xiv) Conditional Admissibility

Carter (1982), 67 C.C.C. (2d) 568 631

(xv) Guilty Plea

Dietrich (1970) 11 C.R.N.S. 22 635
Rimmer (1972), 1 All E.R. 604
Pentiluk (1975), 28 C.R.N.S. 324 637
639

(xvi) Young Offenders Act. 641

9. Admissions

Divorce Act, s.9 642

Admissions (contd)

Yorkton v. Morley (1967), 66 D.L.R.(2d) 37 642
Strand Electric, [1969] 2 C.C.C. 264 644

10. Privilege

Slavutych v. Baker (1977), 38 C.R.N.S. 306 646
Descoteaux v. Mierzwinski (1982), 44 N.R. 462 646
Shenton v. Tyler, [1939] Ch. 620 654
Rumping v. D.P.P., [1962] 3 All E.R. 256 656
St. Jean (1976), 34 C.R.N.S. 378 658
Akey (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 240 660
Jean (1979), 7 C.R.(3d) 333; (1980) 16 C.R.(3d) 193 663
Lloyd (1982), 64 C.C.C.(2d) 169 665
Reference re Legislative Privilege (1978), 39 C.C.C.(2d) 222 667
Health Records (1982), 62 C.C.C.(2d) 193 671
Dubois (1986) 22 C.C.C. (3d) 513 675

11. State Secrets

Duncan v. Cammell, Laird, [1942] A.C. 624 684
Conway v. Rimmer, [1963] A.C. 910 687
Mannix (1982), 126 D.L.R.(3d) 155 692
Re Goguen (1982) 10 C.C.C. (3d) 492 695
Carey v. The Queen (1987), 30 C.C.C. (3d) 498 705

12. Improperly Obtained Evidence

Kuruma, [1955] A.C. 197 726
Sang, [1980] A.C. 402 729
Lawrie v. Muir, [1950] S.L.T. 37 735
Bunning v. Cross (1978), 52 A.L.J.R. 561 736
Criminal Code Sections 178.16, 178.2 739
Stewart (1981), 60 C.C.C.(2d) 407 741
Dass (1979), 47 C.C.C.(2d) 194 742
Goldman (1979), 51 C.C.C.(2d) 1 746
Hogan (1979), 18 C.C.C.(2d) 65

12a. Charter Cases

Hunter v. Southam (1984) 14 C.C.C. (3d) 97 752
Collins (1987), 56 C.R. (3d) 193 763
Therens (1986, 45 C.R. (3d) 97 773

13. Corroboration

Criminal Code Sections 246.4, 586 791
Baskerville, [1916] 2 K.B. 658 793
Ethier, [1959] O.R. 533 796
Hester, [1972] 3 All E.R. 1056 799
Kilbourne, [1973] 1 All E.R. 440 803
Warkentin (1976), 30 C.C.C.(2d) 1 807
Vetrovec (1982), 67 C.C.C.(2d) 1

14. Real Evidence

817
Yachuk v. Blaise, [1944] O.W.N. 412 818
Draper v. Jacklyn, [1968] 2 O.R. 683 820
Parsons (1977), 40 C.R.N.S. 202

15. Judicial Notice

823
Varcoe v. Lee (1919), 180 Cal. 338 827
Savidant (1945), 19 M.P.R. 448

16. Miscellaneous Problems in the Trial Process

829
Cooper (1977), 34 C.C.C.(2d) 18 835
LeMay, [1952] 1 S.C.R. 232 839
Browne v. Dunn (1893), 6 R. 67 841
Dyck, [1970] 2 C.C.C. 283 842
Mete (1973), 22 C.R.N.S. 387 845
Angelantoni (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 342 846
Dobberthien (1973), 13 C.C.C.(2d) 513 850
Sparre (1978), 37 C.C.C.(2d) 495